

PRESENTATION BY

MR. SHAHID HAMID
FORMER GOVERNOR PUNJAB

ON

THE BUREAUCRACY:
THE BUREAUCRACY AS AN
INSTITUTION AND ITS EVOLUTION WITH
FOCUS ON ITS CHANGING ROLE

AT THE

CIVIL SERVICES ACADEMY, LAHORE

ON

24TH NOVEMBER, 2005

INTRODUCTORY REMARKS

To start with let me give you some numbers based on a survey made by the Establishment Division and Planning Commission in the year 2000 for purposes of presentation to the World Bank and IMF. The number of persons in public employment today is 3.2 million. Of these a little over 400,000 are in the state-owned enterprises of the GOP and over 400,000 in the civilian departments of the Federal Government. About 600,000 in the Armed Forces. 1.80 million in the Provincial and Local Governments. Of these 1.80 million, 900,000 in the Education sector, 200,000 in the health sector and 300,000 in the police departments. The remaining 25-26 departments at the provincial and local levels including agriculture and irrigation and food and industries and animal husbandry and roads and highways employ 400,000 only. So in terms of numbers and consequential expenditures the main priorities at the provincial and local levels are education, health and law and order — everything else is far behind.

Leaving aside the 600,000 in the Armed Forces, the 2.60 million in the civilian administration in the Centre and the Provinces have at the apex between 200-250 posts of grade 21 & 22 in the Federal & Provincial Governments. These are the posts of Secretaries, Additional Secretaries and the heads of the attached departments and autonomous and semi-autonomous bodies. There are another 1500+ the Grade 20 level the JSs, Collectors, Commissioners, Conservators, Provincial Secretaries, heads of the smaller autonomous corporations. The incumbents of these posts are the persons primarily and directly responsible for devising and implementation of government policies. It is this civilian bureaucracy that I will be talking to you to-day. Training institutions such as the PASC, NIPA and to begin with your own are designed to produce the best available talent for these posts. However, I want to make a point here which I think is of crucial importance. Management Capacity has to be strengthened at all levels of admn. activity. Efficient top level management is often unable to bring out visible change in the delivery of services to the common man at the ground level especially in education and law and order control, because of deficiencies in skills and training at the lower rungs of the administrative structure. For better governance we need training and re-training from the lowest levels of administration upwards.

A. Evolution, purpose and role of the institution of civil bureaucracy in Pakistan after 1947.

1. Our inheritance from the British was an administrative system designed for two purposes: law and order control, and collection of revenue – both at the provincial level.
2. The Federal Government did not exist – it had to be built from scratch.
3. At the Local Government level there were District Boards headed by elected chairman but supervised and controlled by the Commissioners and Deputy Commissioners.
4. The system was not accountable to the people or their elected representatives but it did contain top-down regulatory and accountability mechanisms.

5. Two post – independence requirements. First, to make the bureaucracy accountable to the people by making them responsive to the political control of the elected representatives. Second, to re-focus their priorities towards development.
6. The first viz accountability to people via elected representatives did not happen largely because of weak, short-lived political governments in the 1947 – 58 period.
7. The second requirement was successfully achieved. The role of the D. C. developed as a coordinator of development activities of all the line departments in the district.
8. With imposition of M. L. in 1958 we moved into a system in which there was a sharing of power between the civil bureaucracy and the higher levels of the armed forces. Political control was not much in evidence even after the election of assemblies in 1962.
9. From 1958 onward we had a Presidential system which automatically converts Pakistan from a Federal to a unitary form of Government – a sort of top-down command structure.
10. Within this system policies were made on basis of proposals of the civil bureaucracy. There was minimal input from the politicians or civil society.
11. At the local level, Basic Democracies introduced in 1959 supplemented by Rural Works Programme brought about welcome and valuable infrastructure additions and employment opportunities especially in rural areas.
12. Draw-backs: One, rigid control of district and divisional level officers, and politicization of system by making B.Ds the electoral college for the President and the Assemblies.
13. The power elite in the system from 1947 to 1969 were the 82 ICS officers supplemented by the annual intake of about 25 CSP officers.
14. These ICS/CSP officers were entitled to and held practically all the top posts at the Federal level and about 2/3rd of the posts of Provincial Secretaries, Commissioners and Deputy Commissioners at the provincial level.
15. There was some sharing of power especially in the Provinces between the All-Pakistan CSP and the only other All-Pakistan service viz the PSP.
16. I was part of the CSP from 1964 onward. My batch-mates included former President Farooq Ahmed Khan Leghari, present Governor SBP Dr. Ishrat Hussain and former Secretary-General Finance Mr. Mueen Afzal.
17. How did the public view the civil servants? Aziz Ahmed C.S. East Pakistan.

18. How did CSPs view outsiders? Professor A. Salam.
19. CSPs did well to preserve their status by absorbing the occasional high talent that emerged in other services viz GIK.
20. 1969: 2nd M. L. 303 senior officers dismissed. Civil bureaucracy reduced to status of junior partner to the military. Air Marshal Nur Khan's whiz kids.
21. At top levels of federal government top civil servants remained in charge. Province of WP dismantled by policies made, approved and implemented by the One Unit Re-organization Committee comprising M.M. Ahmed, GIK and A.G.N. Kazi.
22. Over-mighty province viz Punjab. 12 units merged into WP – only 4 emerged. Compare with fate of Soviet Union, Yugoslavia and Nigeria.
23. In 1971, 12 CSPs were Federal Secretaries, 5 were Additional Secretaries, all 5 CSs were CSPs as well as 3 ACSs. 18 Commissioners, 38 DCs, 5 Judges of High Courts, 12 in all key posts of National Training Institutions and 12 as Chairmen of important Government Corporations. 570 cadre posts vs only 522 officers.
24. PPP Government end 1971. 2nd major shock 1300 – 1400 officers dismissed.
25. Worse to follow: 1973 Administrative Reforms. Constitutional guarantees removed viz no punishment without show cause, no rule variations to disadvantage, one appeal against adverse order, no premature retirement, public service commission to be consulted on all matters relating to recruitment methods and candidate qualifications and policies for promotion, transfer and discipline.
26. Services abolished – replaced by amorphous administrative groups. Large-scale lateral entries at all levels – not through public service commissions.
27. Popular measures – civil bureaucracy became very much responsive to the control of the P. M. and the PPP Governments at the Federal and Provincial levels.
28. 1977. 3rd M. L. Civil bureaucracy back in control but as junior partner to the military high command – weeding out of pro-PPP officers. No reversal of Bhutto Government policies. To the contrary when Supreme Court reversed the dismissal of 303 officers, a further amendment made to set at naught the Supreme Court decision.
29. At the local level – there were no local councils from 1969 – 1979. Punjab passed a Local Government Act in 1975 but not allowed to hold local government elections. Uniform Local Government Ordinances imposed in all provinces in 1979 (1980 in case of Balochistan). However, as in case of

BDs, the controlling authorities for these local councils were the Commissioners, Deputy Commissioners and district level officers.

30. During the Zia-ul-Haq years lateral entries from the civil were gradually stopped but for the 1st time there was a substantial intake of armed forces officers especially at the top and middle levels (about a 100 or so all told).
31. After the lifting of M. L. in 1985 and upto October 1999 the politicians replaced the military high command as the senior policy-making partner in the relationship with the civil bureaucracy.
32. After October 1999 it is once again the military high command which has been the senior partner in this set-up. However, this time there has been a large-scale militarization of the civil bureaucracy. Something like 600 senior level posts in the federal and provincial governments are held by retired and serving military officers.
33. At the local level a fundamental change has been made. Commissioners gone. D.Cs gone. DIGs gone. SPs not gone – back again as DPOs, DCOs now subordinate to the District Nazims i.e. servants of District Governments. No more controlling authorities.

B. Contribution of civil bureaucracy in Pakistan towards National Security.

1. The purpose and role of the civil bureaucracy include:-
 - a. ensuring effective law and order
 - b. promoting the economic and social well-being of the people.
 - c. Providing good governance in the form of efficient delivery of services to the common man especially education, health and civic amenities, and timely response to their individual rights.
 - d. Collecting sufficient revenue to meet the needs of the federal, provincial and local governments.
2. At least 3 of these are also the ingredients/the requirements of national security, internal national security. Poor law and order whether caused by terrorism or otherwise, is a threat to national security. Economic well-being is a core value — a threat to economic welfare can jeopardize physical security. Growing poverty, or even continuance of poverty at the present high levels has a direct negative implication for our security. It leads to internal unrest which manifests itself in a variety of colours be they ethnic, provincial, sectarian or politically motivated. Poor governance especially economic mis-management and inability to combat internal dis-order and ensure good law and order, is a grave threat to internal security. In the context of Pakistan's federal system yet another threat to national security is the estrangement between provinces on vital national issues such as Kalabagh dam, the sharing of financial and water resources and the movement of food-grains especially wheat.
3. Law and order: Performance below average. As stated earlier. Q. is one of perception both at home and abroad. Does the common man feel secure in his home, when his children go to school, when he goes to work or to pray, when his wife goes to the market. There is signal lack of co-operation between the public and the police for control of crime and enforcement of law and order. Statistics here are irrelevant because only 1 in 3 crimes is officially reported and SHOs have a unique way of clearing their crime registers. Prior to the reporting period all unsolved crimes are ascribed to a round-up of the usual suspects. Foreign perception is negative.
4. Terrorism: earlier, sectarian and RAW; today, sectarian and political. Police arm of civil bureaucracy cannot by itself successfully counter terrorism. Needs support of military and para-military units. (Anti-terrorist Legislation of 1997: H. C. judges refused to sit and try terrorists, police would not interrogate. JITs had to be formed). (Ch. Shujaat) (Punjab Elite Force). French experience: OAS. Pooling of intelligence under Interior Minister. Formation of RAID. 200 personnel – Rapid turn-over – not more than 6 months.

5. Economic Well-Being: Rate of economic growth 5-6% over last 50 years. GDP more than 10 times as large as in 1947. Pretty fair record, except when you begin to compare yourself with some of the East Asian and S. E. Asian countries. Recent World Bank Report: in 1965 Pakistan's manufactured goods exports more than Indonesia, Malaysia, Philippines, Thailand and Turkey combined. To-day our manufactured goods exports were $\frac{1}{2}$ those of Philippines, $\frac{1}{7}$ th those of Thailand and $\frac{1}{9}$ th those of Malaysia. WHY? Fundamental distrust/antipathy between bureaucrats and businessmen. Contrast this, for example with Japan's Ministry of Trade & Industry – in pro-active partnership with private sector MITI has coordinated periodic restructuring of local industry, counseled and guided business and industry especially wrt. export markets, helped minimize inter se competition, identified companies with export potential and provided them with R&D funds.
6. Good governance in the form of better delivery of services to the common man. Mixed record. We have Islamabad and certain areas of Lahore, Karachi, Pindi and other major cities. We have a very well-off upper middle class. Middle class has also done well BUT – one-third of the population below poverty line. 6.8 persons per family converts to Rs.12,000 per month. HDI Table. Worst social sector indicators in the SAARC area. 2nd no consistency of policies over sustained periods. 1970s – Planning Commission under its CE Dr. Mehbub-ul-Haq. Coined the phrase “22 families” and advocated nationalization of banks – ideas seized upon by Bhutto and PPP. 8 new education policies. Main difference with East Asian and SE Asian states. 3rd could not prevent dismantlement of F.P. Programme in late 1970s early 1980s. Result Cf. EP vs WP. $4\frac{1}{2}$ times more people to-day. Only $2\frac{1}{2}$ times increase in per capita income.
7. Inter-Provincial Harmony: Not a good record. Example of wheat: Food Secretary Punjab concerned only with achievement of wheat procurement target. Not concerned with Article 151 of the Constitution or effect on relations with NWFP. 1991 Water Accord – study of releases before Kotri – held up for 13 years. Working of IRSA – publicized disagreements every other day. Reluctance to serve in other Provinces. Inability to depart from stated positions.
8. Collection of revenue, basically federal services. World Bank study by M. Zubair 92.8% of revenue collected by GOP 7.2% by Provincial/Local Governments. Expenditure federation 71.5%, Provincial / Local Governments 28.5%. $\frac{3}{4}$ of Provincial/Local Governments expenditure met by federal transfers through NFC Awards. Provincial/Local Government autonomy. Performance below average. The collection could be twice what it is at existing rates. Even 50% more would be extra 300 billion. Revolutionize education and health.

C. **Politicization of the Civil Bureaucracy in Pakistan – Causes and effects :
Socio – Political environment.**

- (1) Bureaucracy does not function in a vacuum but, as the title for to-days discussion correctly recognizes, in a socio-political environment and it is therefore necessary to note certain essential features of the present socio-political environment for proper appreciation of bureaucracy's role or, in certain cases, the failure to perform this role. The features that I propose to note also impinge on our national security.
- (2) Our federation is a multi-lingual multi-ethnic entity. The federation has one dominant province, dominant in the sense that it comprises nearly 60% of the total population, dominant also in the sense that it is perceived to be a dominating presence by large sections of public opinion in the other federating units. There are about 20 constitutional provisions for bringing about harmony of relations between the Centre and the Provinces but these, and other measures, have not thus far brought about consensus of thinking on a number of important issues that constantly impinge on the strength and unity of the federation including the division of power between various parts of Parliament, provincial autonomy, sharing of revenues, sharing of water resources, construction of Kalabagh dam and inter-provincial movement of food grains especially wheat.
- (3) The test of the strength of a democratic system comes as and when there is a transition of power. It is only when a system sees several peaceful transfers of power in accordance with constitutional parameters that it can be said to be a functioning and successful system. The test for the "true democracy" that has emerged in Pakistan will come when there is a transition from a uniformed Presidency to a civilian presidency. The fact that the present President has more or less decided that he needs to retain his uniform to ensure the continuing success of the new system, and the further fact that the 1973 Constitution no longer enjoys universal consensus after its amendment by the Legal Framework Order, are not good portents because they inevitably raise the question whether the system can work or survive without a uniformed Presidency.
- (4) We have weak political parties. One de-stabilizing and undesirable manifestation of this weakness is the flexibility of loyalties. The ease with which our politicians move from one political party into another, and often back again, is because large numbers of these parties are based on personalities and/or formed for the purpose, often with official backing, for supporting or sustaining those in power. Strong political parties are an essential institutional building block for producing competent political leadership and strong political parties and competent political leadership both require the free inter-play of all political forces in periodic elections that are not only free, fair and transparent but also perceived to be such both at home and abroad.

- (5) Bureaucracy used to facilitate change of loyalties. 1985 – 1997 five assemblies, each with 207 elected members of which, on average 125 feudal/tribal, 26 urban professionals, 38 contractors/ businessmen. Bureaucracy also used to suppress political struggles outside parliamentary process.
- (6) Other than the armed forces, whose power and influence is often unsettlingly strong, we have weak institutions. The institutional weaknesses have been partly caused by the prevalence of corruption and certainly aggravated by its continuance.
- (7) A culture of tolerance is not evident in the inter-action between political parties in government as against those in opposition with the result that the latter seek extra-constitutional and extra-parliamentary remedies.
- (8) The independence of the judiciary has been impaired by the number of times judges of the superior courts have been made to swear oaths to defend different constitutional instruments. Presently, the confidence in the fairness and impartiality of the superior judiciary is at a very low ebb. The perception that the course of justice can be either influenced or purchased or both erodes people's confidence in the entire political system.
- (9) Sectarian and other groups who operate outside the pale of the constitution and the law have not sufficiently felt the iron fist promised after every out-rage committed by them.
- (10) External factors particularly the confrontation with India which has required a dis-proportionate allocation of resources for defence at the cost of development expenditure and the needs of the social sectors leading to a situation where we have, with the exception of Nepal, the worst indicators in education and health even in the under-developed SAARC area. An electorate which is half illiterate and in which more than half are uneducated and of which one-third or more live below the poverty line with inadequate health and other civic facilities does not provide a sound base for a stable political or administrative system.
- (11) The middle class in Pakistan wants every one other than itself to be regulated. We want high quality of service but are not prepared to pay for them. Part of the problem stems from our history in which even the middle class did not grow independently in the process of economic growth but flourished due to state patronage and through the employment process in the public sector or through industrial units established in public sector and then handed over to private entrepreneurs. It also benefited through the setting up of private industry which the state protected against competition both domestic and international. Pakistan's civil society in the form of this middle class still does not believe that we can prosper without government benefaction.

- (12) Common and Correct impression that the quality of public service in Pakistan has deteriorated.
- (13) During his address to the Civil Officers at Government House Peshawar on 14th April 1948 the Quaid repeatedly urged them not to indulge in politics or to be pressurized by politicians even if it involved some consequential hardship in the matter of postings and transfers.
- (14) Quaid's advice has not been heeded over the years by either the politicians or the bureaucrats. There has been political involvement in the recruitment process which reached a sort of zenith during the lateral entries in the 1970s. At the lower levels the recruitment process in departments such as the Police and Education, has been an instrument of political patronage. This patronage has protected the corrupt from disciplinary action thereby undermining the integrity and efficiency of the administration. This corruption combined with eroding quality has directly led to poor governance at all levels.
- (15) But it would be simplistic, and incorrect, to blame politicization of the civilian bureaucracy alone as the cause of poor governance. There are many other factors and I will briefly mention them without however assigning greater or lesser weight to any of them. You will to judge for yourselves.
- (16) We have had quota-based recruitments to the federal services. These quotas were due to end in 1993 but were extended through a constitutional amendment upto 2013. In 1996-97 when I was Establishment Minister a study was made as to which area benefited from the quotas and which areas lost out. 557 candidates passed the CSS Exams in 1996 185 vacancies were to be filled by the FPSC on the basis of these result:-

	<u>As per Quota</u>	<u>On merit</u>
Punjab	96	141
NWFP	24	24
Sindh	38	12
Balochistan	18	2
NAs/FATA	7	3
AJK	<u>2</u>	<u>3</u>
	<u>185</u>	<u>185</u>

- (17) There is no financial or other incentive for better performance. Once you reach the top of your pay-scale you move-over automatically to the next higher scale. Promotion is basically determined by seniority. So long as you avoid adverse reports you will climb to the top level regardless of whether you work after office hours or get to office and leave office after and before the official timings.

- (18) The employment opportunities created in a variety of professional, business, trade and management through the process of economic growth have meant that the civil services are no longer attracting the best available talent as was the case in earlier decades when such alternatives were much more limited in scope and numbers.
- (19) Then, there is, for lack, of a better word, the attitude problem Shahid Kardar, for 14 month Punjab's Finance Minister, after his resignation wrote in Dawn of 7.9.2002

“One lesson I learnt was that government is a service of its employees, for its employees and by its employees. Hardly ever in the 14 months did I hear of the rights of the tax-payer or the rights of the recipients of services like education, health and water supply. Only the service providers, the govt. servants, appeared to have rights. They are fully protected and practically unaccountable. It is easier to dismiss a government than a government servant who fails to turn up for work or does not do his duty.”

Shahid Kardar has put it very strongly. I would put it in much milder terms. But even putting it mildly the fact is that there is a lack of empathy between the government servant and the public. Consider for example a Bobby walking the beat in London Streets. He greets all the shop-keepers and property-owners as he walks by. You approach him — sure of his help — in case of need. Is there any such fellow-feeling between our police and the common man. The sad fact is that until such fellow-feeling develops there will be no permanent improvement in law and order because law and order, or the lack of it is in the ultimate analysis a question of public perception.

- (20) Removal of constitutional guarantees and abolition of separate services contributed to politicization because in the post 1973 period — under Bhutto and Zia-ul-Haq and later under Benazir Bhutto and Nawaz Sharif—bureaucrats realized that you needed high political or military connections to obtain, choice postings or promotions. Politicians and senior military officers were in their own interests only too happy to oblige and this “I scratch your back you scratch mine” relationship continues to this day.

D. Senior Executive Service.

1. The greatest challenge and the most fundamental of the changes that needs to be made, pertains to top management. It is the top management of the civil bureaucracy which makes the perspective, the 5 year the annual plans, which produces the various policy options for the governments of the day. It is the senior bureaucracy which is responsible for ensuring implementation of the policies and decisions taken by Government.
2. During my tenure as Establishment Minister in the Care Taker Government of Malik Meraj Khalid, and later as Governor of the Punjab, I put forward a proposal for the establishment of a Senior Executive Service for meeting a part of the problem created by the deterioration in the quality and standards of Government service as a consequence of the removal of the constitutional guarantees and the administrative changes brought about in the early 1970s. I mentioned in the paper prepared by me that a curious anomaly had arisen over the years. Employment in grades 1 to 15 in public service had become more attractive than corresponding employment in the private sector because once employment had been secured in these grades then, amongst other things, there was virtually a guaranteed tenure till retirement regardless of performance or lack of it. The emoluments at the grade 1 to 15 level also compared reasonably well with emoluments in the private sector. On the other hand, employment in grades 16 to 22 in the public sector had become substantially less attractive than the opportunities available in the private sector especially for those who had professional qualifications. The consequential dearth of talent coming into public service was adversely affecting the effective implementation of decisions and policies taken by the respective Governments.
3. There are about 150+ posts of grades 21 and 22 in the Federal and Provincial Governments. These posts include the posts of Secretaries and Additional Secretaries and the heads of the attached departments and autonomous and semi-autonomous bodies. The incumbents of these posts were the persons primarily and directly responsible for the devising and implementation of the policies and decisions taken by Government. It was essential that these posts be manned by the best available talent in the country. This would become available only if Government was ready and willing to pay the right price.
4. The Government should establish a Senior Executive Service for manning these posts. Entry into the service should be at the grade 21 level through a competitive examination held by the Public Service Commission. Both serving government servants and persons in the private sector should be allowed to compete in the examination to be held by the Federal Public Service Commission on an annual basis.
5. For serving government servants the condition of eligibility to compete in the examination should be 4 years service in grade 20, a blood count of

70+ in the Annual Confidential Reports and successful completion of training at the Pakistan Administrative Staff College. For persons in the private sector the condition for eligibility should be age between 40 to 50 years, M. A First Division or equivalent professional qualifications and 18 years experience in specialized fields like banking, accountancy, law, health, education, engineering, economics, insurance and bank management.

6. On appointment to the service the officers should undergo a 3 to 6 months training course at the Pakistan Administrative Staff College. After completion of training posting of individual officers should be made by the Chief Executive on the recommendations of a Senior Appointments Committee comprising 4 or 5 of the senior most secretaries. As a matter of policy an officer appointed to a post should be given a tenure of 3 years and not transferred during this period except for disciplinary reasons. Promotion from grade 21 to grade 22 could be made as per existing rules and practices i.e. by the Chief Executive on the recommendations of the high powered selection board.
7. Grade 21 officers in the proposed Senior Executive Service should be given a total pay package of between Rs.175,000 to Rs.200,000 per month while grade 22 officers should be given a total pay package of between Rs.300,000 to Rs.325,000 per month. The proposed pay package should be suitably re-adjusted for inflation once in 3 years.
8. The Federal Public Service Commission and the Pakistan Administrative Staff College would have to be suitably strengthened and/or reorganized to enable them to hold annual examinations for the Senior Executive Service and to train the officers recruited to this service. The Principal of the College should be from amongst the most senior of the grade 22 officers and should have the status of a Minister of State in order to suitably enhance the prestige of the institution.
9. The retirement age for the Senior Executive Service should be 60 years while, after establishment of this service, the retirement age for officers who do not compete or fail to qualify the competitive examination could be brought down to between 55 and 58 years.
10. This measure will need to be supplemented, in due course by similar changes at the grade 16 to 20 level.